



OFFICE OF INSPECTOR GENERAL
City of Albuquerque

Melissa Santistevan
Inspector General

P.O. Box 1293, Suite 5025
Albuquerque, New Mexico 87103
Telephone: (505) 768-3150
Fax: (505) 768-3158

DATE: April 18, 2022

SUBJECT: Cultural Services: Library, Management Staff Changing Job Description on Posting to Pre-Select

FILE NO: 22-0047

INVESTIGATOR: J.S. *isa*

STATUS: Closed

Informative Case Synopsis

The Office of Inspector General (OIG) received an anonymous complaint on March 16, 2022 through the OIG online Tip and Reporting Form. The complaint stated that "Library: open position was advertised as a web editing position, but follow up email to library staff only said it was for cataloging. They are going to give the position to a person working in library administration already, which is why they are quietly changing the job description. ', 'Job Number', '2201234', 'Emails were sent to all library staff March 4 and 7'".

Pursuant to City Ordinance 2-17-2, the Inspector General's goals are to: (1) Conduct investigations in an efficient, impartial, equitable and objective manner; (2) Prevent and detect fraud, waste and abuse in city activities including all city contracts and partnerships; (3) Deter criminal activity through independence in fact and appearance, investigation and interdiction; and (4) Propose ways to increase the city's legal, fiscal and ethical accountability to insure that tax payers' dollars are spent in a manner consistent with the highest standards of local governments.

Background:

The posted job, with an opening date of March 4, 2022 and closing date of March 21, 2022 was for a *Library Services Supervisor, M14*, and requisition number 2201234. The Job Bulletin states:

POSITION SUMMARY:

Supervise, plan and coordinate the operations and activities of an assigned branch library or library unit; respond to and resolve the more complex and difficult customer inquiries and complaints; coordinate assigned activities with other divisions, outside agencies and the general public and provide highly responsible and complex staff assistance to higher-level supervisory or management staff.

MINIMUM EDUCATION, EXPERIENCE AND ADDITIONAL REQUIREMENTS:

Education and experience directly related to the minimum requirements below may be interchangeable on a year for year basis.

Bachelor's degree from an accredited college or university in library science, business administration, education, humanities, general studies or a related field; and

Three (3) years experience in an academic, public or special library, bookstore environment or related field; and

To include one (1) year supervisory or lead experience.

Image and content editing, website maintenance, and social media management in an academic, public or special library, bookstore environment or related environment preferred.

Outreach experience preferred.

Bilingual (Spanish/English) preferred.

ADDITIONAL REQUIREMENTS:

Possession of a valid New Mexico Driver's License, or the ability to obtain by date of hire. Possession of a City Operator's Permit (COP) within six (6) months from date of hire.

PREFERRED KNOWLEDGE:

- *Operations, services and activities of a municipal library*
- *Principles of efficient and effective public relations and customer service*
- *Modern and complex principles and practices of public library development and administration*
- *Methods and techniques of library circulation, including the Integrated Library System*
- *Methods and techniques of scheduling services and programs*
- *Principles of library reference services*
- *Principles of municipal budget preparation and control*
- *Principles of supervision and training*
- *Modern office procedures, methods and equipment including computers*
- *Dewey Decimal Classification System*
- *Principles and procedures of record keeping*
- *Principles of business letter writing and basic report preparation*
- *Available library resources including the reference collection, serials collection and other on-line resources*
- *Library and City policies and procedures*
- *Pertinent Federal, State, and local laws, codes and regulations*

PREFERRED SKILLS & ABILITIES:

- *Supervise and coordinate the work of lower-level staff*
- *Select, supervise and train staff*
- *Supervise, plan and coordinate the operations and activities of an assigned branch library or library unit*
- *Ensure proper maintenance and safety of assigned facilities*
- *Promote good relations with community organizations and agencies*
- *Prepare clear and concise reports*
- *Respond to requests and inquiries from the general public*
- *Communicate clearly and concisely*
- *Establish and maintain effective working relationships with those contacted in the course of work including a variety of City and other government officials, community groups, and the general public*
- *Independently perform the most difficult library circulation duties*
- *Interpret, explain and enforce department policies and procedures*
- *Collect, analyze and interpret data*
- *Operate a variety of library and office equipment in a safe and effective manner*
- *Perform a variety of duties supporting customer requests*
- *Prepare and coordinate adult and children's library programs and outreach*
- *Understand and follow oral and written instructions*
- *Work independently in the absence of supervision*
- *Perform the essential functions of the job with or without reasonable accommodation*

Under the position summary, the job bulletin further states:

Job descriptions are intended to present a general list of tasks/duties performed by employees within this job classification. Job Descriptions are not intended to reflect all duties performed within the job.

The Job Description, in addition to the verbatim above, included the following:

ESSENTIAL AND SUPPLEMENTAL FUNCTIONS:

ESSENTIAL FUNCTIONS: *(Essential functions may include, but are not limited to the functions listed below)*

1. *Coordinate the organization, staffing and operational activities for an assigned branch library or library unit including, but not limited to, implementing and promoting programs and outreach, circulations processes, and ensuring maintenance of assigned facilities.*
2. *Plan and participate in the provision of library programs; plan story times and reading programs; assist in the maintenance and evaluation special children's collections.*
3. *Prepare and maintain displays; create and implement seasonal and on-going programs and activities including volunteer participation.*
4. *Participate in the development and implementation of goals, objectives, policies and priorities; recommend and implement resulting policies and procedures.*

5. *Identify opportunities for improving service delivery methods and procedures; identify and recommend resource needs; review with appropriate management staff; implement improvements.*
6. *Coordinate and review the work plan for assigned branch library or library unit services; assign work activities and projects; monitor work flow; review and evaluate work products, methods and procedures; meet with staff to identify and resolve problems.*
7. *Assist in the maintenance and development of assigned library collection; remove outdated and unused materials as needed.*
8. *Inspect assigned facilities and equipment to ensure proper maintenance and safety; submit requests for facility maintenance and repair to higher-level library management staff as necessary.*
9. *Oversee the collection of fees and fines; ensure proper depositing of funds and maintenance of financial reports.*
10. *Promote good relations with community organizations and agencies; promote library services and resources; give library tours to groups; prepare informational handouts for public distribution including calendars and flyers; interpret program philosophies and services to groups and individuals.*
11. *Participate in the preparation of schedules of assigned branch library or library unit events; determine when to schedule events according to open dates and available resources.*
12. *May participate in the development, update, and review of system-wide functions, including, but not limited to: cataloging and processing policies, circulation policies, collection development, web services, outreach and marketing; make recommendations for needed modifications.*
13. *Respond to public inquiries and requests for library materials, services and information; provide information regarding programs, policies, procedures and available services; assist patrons in completing requests for material not available in the local collection as needed; respond to and resolve the more complex and difficult customer inquiries and complaints.*
14. *Maintain, review, monitor and investigate customer accounts referred to collections.*
15. *Participate in the selection of branch library or library unit personnel; provide or coordinate staff training; work with employees to correct deficiencies.*
16. *Participate in the development and administration of assigned budget; participate in the forecast of funds needed for staffing, equipment, materials and supplies; monitor expenditures; recommend adjustments as necessary.*
17. *Participate on a variety of committees; prepare and present staff reports and other correspondence as appropriate and necessary.*
18. *Coordinate branch library or library unit activities with those of other divisions and outside agencies and organizations.*
19. *May develop advertising campaigns and promotional materials.*

SUPPLEMENTAL FUNCTIONS:

1. *Attend and participate in professional group meetings; stay abreast of new trends and innovations in the field of public libraries.*
2. *Perform related duties and responsibilities as required.*
3. *Identify circulation software issues and work with library IT staff and software providers to resolve them.*

The email to all staff from the Assistant Library Director sent on March 4, 2022 and referenced by the complainant stated:

Hello Everyone,

The Library has a 40-hour M14 Library Paraprofessional position currently being advertised. The ad closes March 21, 2022.

MINIMUM EDUCATION, EXPERIENCE AND ADDITIONAL REQUIREMENTS:

Education and experience directly related to the minimum requirements below may be interchangeable on a year for year basis.

Bachelor's degree from an accredited college or university in library science, business administration, education, humanities, general studies or a related field; and

Three (3) years experience in an academic, public or special library, bookstore environment or related field; and

To include one (1) year supervisory or lead experience.

Image and content editing, website maintenance, and social media management in an academic, public or special library, bookstore environment or related environment preferred.

Outreach experience preferred.

Bilingual (Spanish/English) preferred.

ADDITIONAL REQUIREMENTS:

Possession of a valid New Mexico Driver's License, or the ability to obtain by date of hire. Possession of a City Operator's Permit (COP) within six (6) months from date of hire.

If you, or someone you know, wishes to apply for the position, please do so before the advertisement closes at 11:59 PM on March 21st.

The second email mentioned by the complainant, dated March 7, 2022 was reviewed by the OIG. As a forward of the May 4, 2022 email, the new note to all staff stated:

Hello again all,

An update on the position below – this position will be in MSS with a focus on copy cataloging.

DISCUSSIONS WITH MANAGEMENT AND REVIEW OF DOCUMENTS:

A review of this email demonstrates that all descriptive language listed matches the wording in the posted job announcement and job description. However, the introduction to the email lists the position title as a 'M14 Library Paraprofessional'.

The job posting closed on March 2, 2022 with twenty-one (21) applicants. Of these, fourteen (14) were referred to the hiring manager to be considered for the next step in the process, with nine (9) of these individuals being current employees. Seven (7) applicants did not qualify based on their responses to the supplemental question on their application.

The above referenced job description covers all five (5) M14 positions in the department; three (3) of which will be at library branches and two (2) being part of Materials Support Services (MSS).

After a discussion with the manager who sent the email, hereinafter referred to as E-1, they indicated that it was an error in typing to name the position with the different title.

E-1 also indicated that they received two (2) follow up questions for clarification on this position: one (1) relating to the location of the position and duties and the other relating to the possibility of a lateral transfer. Each of the questions were answered immediately by E-1.

A discussion was also held with the Director of Art & Culture Department. The Director stated that this position utilized a general job description and did express a desire to edit the posting. The Director stated that while the posting has closed and individuals had applied, they will notify the applicants that it will need to be reposted and in addition, work with the City and Central Human Resource staff to clarify the mandatory and recommended qualifications, requirements and duties of this position.

A discussion was also held with a manager at the City Central Human Resources Department (HR-1). HR-1 stated that the process to make any major changes to a job description must be reviewed and approved by the Classification and Compensation Department. This department is limited to making major revisions to the Job description, without notifying the union.

As per LOCAL 3022 AFSCME, COUNCIL 18, AFL-CIO, 20.3 Classification/ Recognition 20.3.1 Prior to revising existing classifications or establishing new classifications, the Employer will notify the Union of its anticipated action and offer the Union the opportunity to provide input and recommendations related to whether or not the affected positions shall be included in the Union's bargaining unit. Either party may bring this issue for discussion in the Union-Employer Committee (UEC) if it deems necessary. In the event of a dispute, either party may take the issue to the Labor Board for resolution.

HR-1 reviewed and sent the changes to the OIG made on March 1, 2022 to the job description subject to this investigation. The changes involved formatting only and the addition to the Driver's license language, which is standard language that is being incorporated to all job descriptions when driving is required.

CONCLUSION:

Based on the aforementioned fact-finding investigation, the allegation that the posting was changed to allow for the hiring of a specific individual could not be substantiated. However, management of the department did proactively find a need to clarify the position description and posting announcement, due to the M14 description covering multiple positions and functions, as it is a generalist position.

On April 15, 2022, the job posting was cancelled and notices were sent to all individuals who had previously applied. They are working to revise the job description and will repost the job advertisement when complete. The changes will involve, but are not limited to, editing and ensuring that skills and requirements in the 'preferred' category belong or possibly be moved to the 'essential functions may include' category.